# Low total cholesterol is associated with high total mortality in patients with coronary heart disease 

S. Behar, E. Graff*, H. Reicher-Reiss, V. Boyko, M. Benderly, A. Shotan<br>and D. Brunner for the Bezafibrate Infarction Prevention (BIP) Study Group*<br>Neufeld Cardiac Research Institute, Sheba Medical Center, Tel Hashomer, and *Institute of Physiological Hygiene, Edith Wolfson Medical Center, Holon, Israel


#### Abstract

The present non-intervention screening study was undertaken to explore the relationships between pre-existing low total cholesterol and all-cause mortality. Eleven thousand, five hundred and sixty-three patients with coronary heart disease who attended a screening visit but were not included in the Bezafibrate Infarction Prevention study were followed-up for a mean of $3 \cdot 3$ years after determination of baseline total cholesterol. Five hundred and ninety-five (5\%) of this largely unselected population who had total cholesterol levels $\leq 160 \mathrm{mg} . \mathrm{dl}^{-1}$ formed the study population. The remaining 10968 patients acted as controls. The relative risk of all-cause mortality among patients with low cholesterol compared to others was $1 \cdot 49$ ( $95 \% \mathrm{CI}$ : $1 \cdot 16-$ $1-91$ ). The relative risk of non-cardiac death was 2.27 times


higher in the low cholesterol group than in the controls ( $95 \% \mathrm{Cl}: 1 \cdot 49-3 \cdot 45$ ), whereas the risk of cardiac death was the same in both groups (relative risk $1.09 ; 95 \% \mathrm{Cl}$ : $0.76-1.56$ ). The most frequent cause of non-cardiac death associated with low total cholesterol was cancer. These results in patients with coronary heart disease add weight to previous studies associating low total cholesterol with an increased risk of non-cardiac death. However, a longer follow-up of this cohort of patients is necessary in order to clarify this association.
(Eur Heart J 1997; 18: 52-59)
Key Words: Total cholesterol, coronary heart disease, cardiac mortality, non-cardiac mortality.

## Introduction

The link between high total serum cholesterol levels and the risk of cardiac mortality has been well established ${ }^{[1-3]}$. A meta-analysis of 19 primary and secondary intervention studies has estimated that for every $1 \%$ reduction in total cholesterol there is a $2.5 \%$ decrease in the incidence of coronary heart disease ${ }^{[2]}$. The same study found that, on average, an 8 to $9 \%$ reduction in total cholesterol was required to lower mortality from coronary heart disease. More recently two major studies have clearly shown that lowering total cholesterol with statins in patients with proven coronary heart disease (secondary prevention) or among men at high risk but free from coronary heart disease (primary prevention) resulted in highly significant reductions of total and cardiac mortality with no effect on the non-cardiac death rates ${ }^{[4,5]}$.

Although the benefits of lowering blood cholesterol in order to protect patients from premature death caused by myocardial infarction or stroke are undis-

[^0]puted, national campaigns to identify high cholesterol in the community need to give serious consideration to the increasing body of evidence from epidemiological studies linking low total cholesterol to an increased risk of non-cardiac mortality ${ }^{[1,6-9]}$. Lung cancer is the most consistent cause of non-cardiac death to be associated with low serum cholesterol levels ${ }^{[10-12]}$. The incidence of cancer of the colon is also strongly correlated but no association has been found for gastric, rectal ${ }^{[3]}$ or brain cancer ${ }^{[13]}$.

The general consensus is that the risk of noncardiac death increases when total cholesterol falls to $\leq 160 \mathrm{mg} . \mathrm{dl}^{-1}$. It is therefore important that the theoretical possibility of lowering cholesterol too far does not have a negative impact on health care objectives of reducing the incidence of fatal cardiac events in high risk patients. The recommended policy (especially in primary prevention) is to use drug intervention conservatively, especially in young and elderly patients and only after dietary and life style changes have been shown to have failed ${ }^{[8]}$

Most of the studies linking low total cholesterol to non-cardiac death have been conducted in general population cohorts and seldom specifically among patients with coronary heart disease. The aim of the present study was to investigate whether a relationship
exists between a pre-existing low total cholesterol ( $\leq 160 \mathrm{mg} . \mathrm{dl}^{-1}$ ) at screening and subsequent mortality resulting from both cardiac and non-cardiac events in patients with coronary artery disease. The population was selected from the total cohort of 14685 patients who were screened for the Bezafibrate Infarction Prevention (BIP) study ${ }^{[14,15]}$. This population of cardiac patients is probably one of the largest ever studied. The BIP study is an intervention trial designed to assess the efficacy of long-term bezafibrate administration on reduction of fatal and non-fatal coronary events in patients with coronary heart disease, a low HDL cholesterol, and moderately elevated total cholesterol ${ }^{[14]}$.

## Methods

## Patient selection

The patients were recruited from 18 cardiac departments in Israel. It was our intention to conduct this investigation in a largely unselected group of patients of either gender, aged between 45 and 74 years, who had a history of myocardial infarction or coronary insufficiency. The diagnosis of coronary insufficiency included typical angina documented by a positive exercise test, radionuclear studies or coronary angiography.

Out of the 14685 patients screened for the BIP study, 3122 patients with moderately elevated total cholesterol ( $>180 \mathrm{mg} . \mathrm{dl}^{-1}$ and $<250 \mathrm{mg} . \mathrm{dl}^{-1}$ ) and relatively low HDL-cholesterol ( $\leq 45 \mathrm{mg} . \mathrm{dl}^{-1}$ ) were randomized to be treated with placebo or bezafibrate (Bezalip Retard) and therefore excluded from the present analysis. Eleven thousand, five hundred and sixty-three patients who failed to fulfil the BIP entry criteria form the cohort of the present study.

## Clinical assessments

Age-eligible patients with documented coronary heart disease were invited to a screening examination during which medical and historical data were recorded and blood was drawn for the assessment of the lipid profile. Baseline blood cholesterol, HDL-cholesterol and triglycerides were measured at a central laboratory (Edith Wolfson Medical Center, Holon) from samples taken at the screening visit after the patients had fasted for 14 h . The samples were drawn into vacuum tubes containing a separation gel. After 30 min at room temperature, the tubes were centrifuged at $4^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ for 15 min at 3000 rpm and the serum was separated from the plasma.

All assays were performed on a BoehringerHitachi 704 random access analyser using BoehringerMannheim diagnostic kits. Free glycerol was determined separately with an enzymatic kit (Sigma Chemical, St Louis, MO, U.S.A.) and was subtracted from the triglyceride level. HDL-cholesterol was determined by precipitation of LDL- and VLDL-cholesterol with phosphotungstate. The total cholesterol concentration was determined in the supernatant.

The low cholesterol group included patients with spontaneous total cholesterol of $\leq 160 \mathrm{mg} . \mathrm{dl}^{-1}$. Per protocol none of these patients were included in the intervention study (BIP). All others screened with a total cholesterol of $>160 \mathrm{mg} . \mathrm{dl}^{-1}$, but not randomized to BIP, formed the control group.

Mortality data were obtained from the Israeli population registry a mean 3.3 years (range 31-55 months) after the screening visit.

## Statistical assessments

The objective of the analysis was to compare mortality in patients with low baseline cholesterol ( $\leq 160 \mathrm{mg}$. $\mathrm{dl}^{-1}$ ) with those in a control group who had baseline cholesterol $>160 \mathrm{mg} . \mathrm{dl}^{-1}$. Cause of death was classified using the DHHS ICD-9 system ${ }^{[16]}$. Cardiac deaths included codes 410-414 (coronary) and 415-429 (other cardiac). SAS software was used for statistical analysis. Multivariate analysis of long-term mortality was performed using the Mantel-Haenszel pooled relative risk model (procedure FREQ with CMH option). Actuarial survival curves were produced using the LIFETEST procedure ${ }^{[17]}$.

## Results

## Demographic data

Only patients who were excluded from the BIP study and who had complete mortality data were included in the present analysis ( $\mathrm{n}=11563$ ). Low total cholesterol ( $\leq 160 \mathrm{mg} \cdot \mathrm{dl}^{-1}$ ) was prevalent in approximately $5 \%$ of this large unselected study cohort ( $\mathrm{n}=595$ ). The baseline characteristics of these 11563 patients are summarized in Table 1. There was a slightly higher proportion of male patients in the low cholesterol group ( $89 \%$ ) than in the control group ( $78 \%$ ), but in terms of age, previous cardiovascular disease, co-existing illness and smoking habit the two groups were directly comparable. The majority of patients were in NYHA Class $1 ; 68 \%$ of the study group and $71 \%$ of the control group had previously suffered myocardial infarction. All other patients had proven coronary insufficiency. Approximately 28\% of patients in both groups presented with symptoms of angina and approximately $33 \%$ were hypertensive. Patients with known cancer were excluded from the screening programme. However, four patients with low total cholesterol ( $0.7 \%$ ) and 42 in the control group ( $0.3 \%$ ) were diagnosed as having cancer during the screening period.

The population with low cholesterol comprised $6 \%$ of all male patients and $3 \%$ of all female patients. The higher prevalence of male patients with low cholesterol was statistically significant. There was also a tendency towards low cholesterol being more prevalent in patients $>60$ years than in the younger age group (Table 2).

Table 1 Baseline patient characteristics

|  | Number (\%) patients |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Total cholesterol $\leq \underset{(n=595)}{160 \mathrm{mg} \cdot \mathrm{dl}^{-1}}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Total cholesterol } \\ & >160 \mathrm{mg} . \mathrm{dl}^{-1} \\ & (\mathrm{n}=10968) \end{aligned}$ |
| Male | 531 (89) | 8522 (78) |
| Age (mean $\pm$ SD) years | $60 \cdot 6 \pm 7 \cdot 3$ | $59.8 \pm 7 \cdot 1$ |
| Previous myocardial infarction | 401 (68) | 7760 (71) |
| NYHA class |  |  |
| I | 421 (73) | 7557 (71) |
| II | 120 (21) | 2424 (23) |
| III-IV | 37 (6) | 666 (6) |
| Angina class (II to IV)* | 159 (27) | 3187 (29) |
| Hypertension | 188 (32) | 3681 (34) |
| Diabetes | 146 (25) | 2336 (21) |
| Cerebrovascular accident | 10 (2) | 206 (2) |
| Peripheral vascular disease | 27 (5) | 456 (4) |
| Chronic obstructive pulmonary disease | 17 (3) | 334 (3) |
| Current smoking | 64 (11) | 1251 (11) |

NYHA = New York Heart Association.
*Symptoms reported during the screening visit.

The mean total blood cholesterol at baseline was $147 \mathrm{mg} . \mathrm{dl}^{-1}$ in the low cholesterol group and $230 \mathrm{mg} . \mathrm{dl}^{-1}$ in the control group. HDL-cholesterol and plasma triglyceride levels were also lower in the patients with total cholesterol $\leq 160 \mathrm{mg} . \mathrm{dl}^{-1}$ than in those with total cholesterol $>160 \mathrm{mg} . \mathrm{dl}^{-1}$ (Table 3).

Treatment with beta-blockers, nitrates, calcium antagonists, digitalis and aspirin was comparable in the two groups of patients (Table 4). Fifteen patients with low total cholesterol ( $2 \cdot 5 \%$ ) and 524 in the control group ( $3.7 \%$ ) were taking lipid lowering agents at the time of the screening visit.

## Survival analysis

The patients were followed-up for a mean of 3.3 years after the screening visit. There were a total of 903 deaths ( $8 \%$ ). Mortality from all causes was significantly higher in patients with low total cholesterol ( $11.8 \%$ ) than in patients with total cholesterol $>160 \mathrm{mg} . \mathrm{dl}^{-1}(7 \cdot 6 \%)$. Multivariate analysis showed that the relative risk of death from all causes was $1 \cdot 49$-times higher ( $95 \% \mathrm{CI}$ : $1 \cdot 16-1 \cdot 91$ ) in patients with low total cholesterol than in the control population (Table 5).

The total incidence of cardiac death was similar in both groups (relative risk: 1-09); the most frequent cause was coronary artery disease which accounted for mortality in $4.0 \%$ of study patients and in $3.8 \%$ of the control population (Table 6). The cardiac death rate was only slightly higher in patients above 60 years of age than in the younger patients. In both age groups mortality was higher in those with low cholesterol than in the control patients (Table 5).

The relative risk of non-cardiac death was $2 \cdot 27-$ times higher ( $95 \% \mathrm{CI}$ : 1-49-3.45) in patients with low total cholesterol than in the control population (Table
5). The incidence of non-cardiac death appeared to be at least twice as high in patients $>60$ years of age than in younger patients. However, at least a two-fold increase in relative risk of non-cardiac death associated with low total cholesterol was preserved within each age category (Table 5). The increased risk appeared to be highest in the younger patients with lower cholesterol (relative risk $=3.23$ ) but the results in this sub-group showed wide variation ( $95 \% \mathrm{CI}$ : $1 \cdot 38-7 \cdot 57$ ).

Neoplasms were the most frequent single cause of non-cardiac death (Table 6). Cancer-related deaths occurred in $1.8 \%$ of patients with low total cholesterol and in $1 \%$ of the control group. Although the prevalence of cancer during the screening period was higher in the study population $(0.7 \%)$ than in the control population ( $0.3 \%$ ), the results indicate an increased incidence of newly acquired cancer in approximately $1 \cdot 1 \%$ of the low cholesterol group compared with $0.7 \%$ of the control group. It is noteworthy that liver disease was the second most common cause of non-cardiac death associated with low cholesterol ( $0 \cdot 8 \%$ ) although it was not a cause of death in the control group. The likelihood of dying from other non-cardiac causes was also approximately 1.5 times higher amongst patients with low total cholesterol. Deaths caused by injury or poisoning occurred rarely (Table 6).

Kaplan-Meier survival curves for total mortality, non-cardiac mortality and cardiac mortality are shown in Figs 1 to 3, respectively. In the control group the mortality rate associated with both cardiac and non-cardiac events was linear throughout the observation period

## Discussion

The main objective in this observational study was to establish if there was a link between increased

Table 2 Prevalence of low total cholesterol (i.e. $\leq 160 \mathrm{mg} . \mathrm{dl}^{-1}$ ) among subgroup of patients

|  | All patients | Patients with total cholesterol $\leq 160 \mathrm{mg} . \mathrm{dl}^{-1}$ |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | Number of patients | $\%$ of total population in each category |
| Male | 9053 | 531 | 6* |
| Female | 2510 | 64 | 3 |
| Age |  |  |  |
| $\leq 60$ years | 5616 | 246 | 4 |
| $>60$ years | 5947 | 349 | 6* |
| Previous MI |  |  |  |
| yes | 8161 | 401 | 5 |
| no | 3359 | 192 | 6 |
| NYHA class |  |  |  |
| I | 7978 | 421 | 5 |
| II-IV | 3247 | 157 | 5 |
| Angina class |  |  |  |
| I | 3589 | 205 | 6 |
| II-IV | 3346 | 159 | 5 |
| Hypertension |  |  |  |
| yes | 3869 | 188 | 5 |
| no | 7653 | 404 | 5 |
| Diabetes |  |  |  |
| yes | 2482 | 146 | 6 |
| no | 9041 | 448 | 5 |
| CVA |  |  |  |
| yes | 216 | 10 | 5 |
| no | 11309 | 583 | 5 |
| PVD |  |  |  |
| yes | 483 | 27 | 6 |
| no | 10979 | 564 | 5 |
| COPD |  |  |  |
| yes | 351 | 17 | 5 |
| no | 11140 | 574 | 5 |
| Current smoking |  |  |  |
| yes | 1315 | 64 | 5 |
| no | 10215 | 530 | 5 |

COPD = chronic obstructive pulmonary disease; CVA = cerebrovascular accident; PVD = peripheral vascular disease; $\mathrm{MI}=$ myocardial infarction; ${ }^{*} P<0.001$ Chi-square test.
Note: details of some variables were not available for all patients.

Table 3 Baseline lipid profile

|  | Mean $\pm$ SD |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
|  | Total cholesterol <br> $\leq 160 \mathrm{mg} \cdot \mathrm{dl}^{-1}$ <br> $(\mathrm{n}=595)$ | Total cholesterol <br> $>160 \mathrm{mg} \cdot \mathrm{dl}-1$ <br> $(\mathrm{n}=10968)$ |
|  |  |  |
| Total cholesterol $\left(\mathrm{mg} \cdot \mathrm{dl}^{-1}\right)$ | $147 \pm 12$ | $230 \pm 40$ |
| HDL-cholesterol $\left(\mathrm{mg} \cdot \mathrm{dl}^{-1}\right)$ | $32 \cdot 5 \pm 8 \cdot 5$ | $39 \cdot 1 \pm 10.9$ |
| Triglycerides $\left(\mathrm{mg} \cdot \mathrm{dl}^{-1}\right)$ | $119 \cdot 1 \pm 66 \cdot 1$ | $167 \cdot 9 \pm 103$ |

non-cardiac mortality and low total cholesterol in a largely unselected population of patients with coronary artery disease.

Our findings clearly show that total cholesterol levels $\leq 160 \mathrm{mg}$. $\mathrm{dl}^{-1}$ were associated with an excess of non-cardiac and total mortality amongst 11563 coronary patients of both genders aged between 45 and 74 years. The incidence of non-cardiac death was twice

Table 4 Medical treatment

|  | Number (\%) patients |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
|  | Total cholesterol <br> $\leq 160 \mathrm{mg} \cdot \mathrm{dl}^{-1}$ <br> $(\mathrm{n}=595)$ | Total cholesterol <br> $>160 \mathrm{mg} \cdot \mathrm{dl}^{-1}$ <br> $(\mathrm{n}=10968)$ |
|  |  |  |
| Medical treatment |  |  |
| Beta-blockers   <br> Nitrates $303(31)$ $3773(34)$ <br> Calcium antagonists $284(48)$ $5427(49)$ <br> Digitalis $38(6)$ $5553(51)$ <br> Aspirin $333(56)$ $508(5)$ <br> Lipid lowering agents $15(2 \cdot 5)$ $6274(57)$ <br>   $524(3 \cdot 7)$ |  |  |

as high as in the control population, the most frequent single cause of non-cardiac death being cancer. It should be emphasised that these low levels of total cholesterol were pre-existing at the screening visit. They were not the consequence of pharmacological

Table 5 Relative risk of mortality after mean follow-up of $3 \cdot 3$ years from screening visit

$\mathrm{Cl}=$ confidence interval.
*Pooled relative risk; adjustment for age, gender, HDL $<35 \mathrm{mg} . \mathrm{dl}^{-1}$; glucose $>120 \mathrm{mg} . \mathrm{dl}^{-1}$, NYHA, previous MI, diabetes, COPD, hypertension, PVD, angina, current smoking.
†ICD-9 codes 410-429.

Table 6 Causes of cardiac and non-cardiac mortality all patients

| ICD-9 code | Number (\%) patients |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Total cholesterol $\leq 160 \mathrm{mg} . \mathrm{dl}^{-1}$ ( $\mathrm{n}=595$ ) | Total cholesterol $>160 \mathrm{mg}_{\mathrm{ml}}{ }^{-1}$ ( $\mathrm{n}=10968$ ) |
| Cardiac |  |  |
| 410-429 all | 33 (5.6) | 502 (4.6) |
| 410-414 coronary | 24 (4.0) | 421 (3-8) |
| 415-429 other cardiac | 9 (1.5) | 81 (0.7) |
| Non-cardiac |  |  |
| Total | 27 (4.5) | 248 (2.3) |
| neoplasms | 11 (1.8) | 111 (1.0) |
| liver disease | $5(0.8)$ | - |
| injury and porson | $2(0 \cdot 3)$ | $18(0 \cdot 2)$ |
| CVA | 2 (0.3) | $36(0 \cdot 3)$ |
| other | 7 (1.2) | 83 (0.8) |
| Unknown | $10(1.7)$ | 83 (0.8) |

intervention. Indeed only $2 \cdot 5 \%$ of the low cholesterol group had previously been treated with lipid lowering drugs.

Studies linking low total cholesterol to noncoronary mortality often fail to demonstrate cause and effect relationships ${ }^{[8]}$. A study in over 360000 men aged between 35 and 57 years, found a statistically significant excess of cancer during the early years of follow-up in patients who were in the lowest $10 \%$ of the serum cholesterol distribution ${ }^{[9]}$. Low levels of serum cholesterol were more marked in the 150 patients who died from cancer than in the survivors. It was concluded that the relationship between low serum cholesterol and
cancer is, at least in part, due to an effect of preclinical cancer on serum cholesterol levels. There may also be an association between the low total cholesterol and the wasting component of the disease ${ }^{[12]}$.

A second study in over 11000 healthy men showed that the risk of lung cancer over a 15 -year period was highest when total cholesterol was below $170 \mathrm{mg} . \mathrm{dl}^{-1[10]}$. Deaths from lung cancer were not related to age, blood pressure, smoking habits or body weight. Other investigators have linked serum cholesterol levels $<160 \mathrm{mg} . \mathrm{dl}^{-1}$ with a twofold increase in the risk of intracranial haemorrhage, a significantly increased risk of death from cancer of the liver, pancreas and haematopoietic system, and an increased incidence of death from respiratory, hepatic and digestive disease ${ }^{[1]]}$. There is general agreement, however, that low total cholesterol is not involved in the incidence or mortality associated with brain cancer ${ }^{[13,18,19]}$.

A recent study in 5941 men without a history of cardiovascular, gastrointestinal or liver disease showed that declining total cholesterol was associated with an increased risk of death due to cancer (particularly haematopoetic, oesophageal and prostatic) and noncardiovascular death (especially liver disease) ${ }^{[20]}$. In our study liver disease was the second most common cause of non-cardiac death and was only observed amongst patients with total cholesterol $\leq 160 \mathrm{mg}$. $\mathrm{dl}^{-1}$ (Table 6) However, the mortality rates were too low to enable the statistical significance of the findings to be tested. There was a low incidence of mortality caused by injury and poisoning in both groups ( 0.2 to $0.3 \%$ ). We are, therefore, unable to confirm previous reports linking traumatic death, depression and suicide to low serum cholesterol ${ }^{[21]}$.


Figure 1 Kaplan-Meier survival curve for all causes of death in patients with total cholesterol $\leq 160 \mathrm{mg} . \mathrm{dl}^{-1}(--)$ and $>160 \mathrm{mg} . \mathrm{dl}^{-1}(\square)$.


Figure 2 Kaplan-Meier survival curve for non-cardiac deaths in patients with total cholesterol $\leq 160 \mathrm{mg} \cdot \mathrm{dl}^{-1}(--)$ and $>160 \mathrm{mg} \cdot \mathrm{dl}^{-1}(-)$.

It is not possible on the basis of the present observational study to determine whether low total cholesterol is a marker or a precursor of the diseases which cause higher non-cardiac mortality among patients with coronary heart disease. Although our findings generally support those of other epidemiological studies, a recent systematic review of the 10 largest cohort studies examining relationships between serum cholesterol and non-cardiac mortality found that the only cause of death attributable to low serum cholesterol was haemorrhagic stroke ${ }^{[22]}$. The general population studies, which included subjects with chronic disease, demonstrated clear associations between low total chol-
esterol and lung cancer, liver disease, chronic bronchitis, suicide and bowel disease. However, these associations were not found in studies confined to healthy working men. The authors, therefore, concluded that the low total cholesterol concentrations were caused by the same factors that precipitated these ultimately fatal diseases ${ }^{[2]]}$. The hypothesis that catabolic diseases such as cancers and liver disease may decrease total cholesterol has been supported by results from a recent study in which total cholesterol levels were determined in a population over 10 years ${ }^{[20]}$. The study included patients with a 'naturally' low cholesterol and those with low total cholesterol due to cholesterol-lowering treatments.


Figure 3 Kaplan-Meier survival curve for cardiac deaths in patients with total cholesterol $\leq 160 \mathrm{mg} . \mathrm{dl}^{-1}(--)$ and $>160 \mathrm{mg} . \mathrm{dl}^{-1}(\square)$.

In a meta-analysis of 35 trials which evaluated the effect of cholesterol lowering therapy on coronary and non-coronary mortality, cholesterol lowering was shown to be beneficial ${ }^{[23]}$. Recently two major publications ${ }^{[4,5]}$ have clearly shown that lowering total cholesterol was strongly associated with decreased total and cardiovascular mortality without any increase of the non-cardiac cause of death. It is therefore important to emphasize that in the present study, increased noncardiac cause of death was observed among patients with spontaneously low total cholesterol and that low levels of total cholesterol resulting from diet or medical treatment, were not incriminated with excess mortality ${ }^{[4,5]}$. It seems, therefore, that spontaneous low total cholesterol should be considered as a marker rather than a precursor of subsequent non-cardiac death among patients with coronary artery disease.

## Limitations

The present study is based on only a single measure of cholesterol and therefore we could not examine the risk according to whether the low cholesterol level was stable over years or whether low cholesterol resulted from failing blood cholesterol levels. In addition, the mean time of follow-up was relatively short. It has been suggested that at least 10 years of follow-up is required to analyse fully any association between cholesterol and all cause mortality ${ }^{[7]}$. For this reason our follow-up of this large cohort of subjects is continuing.

We are most grateful to Ms Dalia Ben-David for coordinating the keying and verification of input data, to Mr Mark Goldberg for programming the data base, to Ms Lynn Goodman for typing the manuscript, and to Ms Lori Mandelzweig for editorial assistance.

## References

[1] Criquı MH. Cholesterol, primary and secondary prevention, and all cause mortality. Ann Intern Med 1992; 115: 973-6.
[2] Holme I. An analysis of randomized trials evaluating the effect of cholesterol reduction on total mortality and coronary heart disease incidence. Circulation 1990; 82: 1916-24.
[3] Stemmermann GN, Choyou PH, Kagan A, Nomura AM, Yako K. Serum cholesterol and mortality among JapaneseAmerican men. The Honolulu (Hawaii) Heart Program. Arch Intern Med 1991; 151: 969-72.
[4] Scandinavian Simvastatin Survival Study Group. Randomized trial of cholesterol lowering in 4444 patients with coronary heart disease: The Scandinavian Simvastatin Survival Study (4S). Lancet 1994; 344: 1383-9.
[5] Shepherd J, Cobbe SM, Ford I et al. for the West of Scotland Coronary Prevention Study Group. Prevention of coronary heart disease with Pravastatin in men with hypercholesterolemia. N Engl J Med 1995; 333: 1301-7.
[6] Frank JW, Reed DM, Grove JS, Benfante R. Will lowering serum concentrations of total cholesterol affect total mortality? Expectations from the Honolulu Heart program. J Clin Epidemiol 1992; 45: 333-46.
[7] Pekkanen J, Nissinen A, Punsar S, Karvonen MJ. Short- and long-term association of serum cholesterol with mortality. The 25-year follow-up of the Finnish cohorts of the Seven Countries Study. Am J Epidemiol 1992; 135: 1251-8.
[8] La Rosa JC. Cholesterol lowering, low cholesterol, and mortality. Am J Cardiol 1993; 72: 776-86.
[9] Sherwin RW, Wentworth DN, Cutler JA, Hulley SB, Kuller LH, Stamler J. Serum cholesterol levels and cancer mortality in 361662 men screened for the Multiple Risk Factor Intervention Trial. JAMA 1987; 267: 943-8.
[10] Keys A, Aravanis C, Blackburn H et al. Serum cholesterol and cancer mortality in the Seven Countries Study. Am J Epidemiol 1985; 121: 870-83.
[11] Neaton JD, Blackburn H, Jacobs D et al. Serum cholesterol level and mortality findings for men screened in the Multiple Risk Factor Intervention Trial. Arch Intern Med 1992; 152. 1490-1500.
[12] Jacobs D, Blackburn H, Higgins M et al. for the participants in the Conference on Low Cholesterol: Mortality Associ-
ations: Report of the Conference on Low Blood Cholesterol: Mortality Associations. Circulation 1992: 86: 1046-60.
[13] Herrington LJ, Friedman GD. Serum cholesterol concentration and risk of brain cancer. Br Med J 1995; 310: 367-8.
[14] Goldbourt U, Behar S, Reicher-Reiss H et al. for the Bezafibrate Infarction Prevention Study Group: Rationale and design of a secondary prevention trial of increasing serum high-density lipoprotein cholesterol and reducing triglycerides in patients with clinically manifest atherosclerotic heart disease (the Bezafibrate Infarction Prevention Trial). Am J Cardiol 1993; 71: 909-14.
[15] The Bezafibrate Infarction Prevention (BIP) Study Group Israel: Lipids and lipoproteins in symptomatic coronary heart disease. Circulation 1992; 86: 839-48.
[16] US Department of Health and Human Services International Classification of Diseases ICD.9.CM, 9th Revision, 3rd edn: March 1989. DHHS Publication No. (PHS) 89-1260.
[17] The LIFETEST procedure. SAS/STAT User's Guide, Vol 2, Version 6, Fourth Edition. SAS Institute Inc, Cary, NC, 1990: 1027-69.
[18] Knekt P, Reunanen A, Teppo L. Serum cholesterol concentration and the risk of primary brain tumours. Br Med J 1991; 302. 90.
[19] Davey Smith G, Neaton JD, Ben-Shomo T, Shipley M, Wentworth D. Serum cholesterol concentration and primary malignant brain tumours: a prospective study Am J Epidemiol 1992; 135: 259-65.
[20] Iribarren C, Reed DM, Chen R, Yano K, Dwyer JH. Low serum cholesterol and mortality. Which is the cause and which is the effect? Circulation 1995; 92: 2396-2403.
[21] Law MR, Thompson SG, Wald NJ. Assessing possible hazards of reducing serum cholesterol. Br Med J 1994; 308: 373-9.
[22] Jacobs DR, Mudden MF, Abstein L. Low blood cholesterol, nonillness mortality and other nonatherosclerotic disease mortality: a search for causes and confounders. Am J Epidemiol 1995; 141: 518-21.
[23] Gould AL, Rossow JE, Santanello NC, Heyse JF, Furberg CD. Cholesterol reduction yields clinical benefit. A new look at old data. Circulation 1995; 91: 2274-82.

## Appendix

## BIP study group

Participating centres and committee membership
Scientific committee: Jacob Agmon, MD; Solomon Behar, MD; Daniel Brunner, MD (Chairman); Avraham Caspi, MD; Uri Goldbourt, PhD; Eran Graff, PhD; Elieser Kaplinsky, MD; Yehezkiel Kishon, MD; Henrietta Reicher-Reiss, MD; and Joshua Waysbort, MD.

Participating centres, principal investigators and physicians:
Assaf Harofe Hospital, Zrifin: Zwi Schlesinger, MD, and Aharon Fridensohn, MD.
Barzilai Medical Center, Ashkelon: Leonardo Reisin, MD, and Jamal Jafari, MD.

Beilinson Medical Center, Petach-Tikva: Samuel Sclarovsky, MD, Yaakov Friedman, MD, and Bruno Ostfeld, MD.
Bnei-Zion Hospital, Haifa: Edward Abinader, MD, and Shmuel Rochfleish, MD.
Carmel Hospital, Haifa: Abraham Palant, MD, and Hanan Schneider, MD
Central HaEmek Hospital, Afula: Tiberio Rosenfeld, MD, and Suleiman Khalid, MD.
Edith Wolfson Medical Center, Holon: Yehezkiel Kishon, MD and Rene Rotzak, MD.
Hasharon Hospital, Petach-Tikva: Izhar Zahavi, MD, and Janash Vitrai, MD.
Hillel Yaffe Hospital, Hadera: Benyamin Pelled, MD, and Joseph Pardu, MD.
Ichilov Hospital, Sorasky Medical Center, Tel-Aviv: Shlomo Laniado, MD, Libi Sherf, MD, Shimon Braun, MD, and Yemima Eschar, MD.
Kaplan Hospital, Rehovot: Avraham Caspi, MD, Alexander Arditi, MD, and Shulamit Botwin, MD.
Meir Hospital, Sapir Medical Center, Kfar Saba: Daniel David, MD, and Daniel Weisnenberg, MD.
Naharia Hospital, Naharia: Nathan Roguin, MD, and Alicia Glusman, MD.
Rambam Medical Center, Haifa: Walter Markiewicz, MD, and Diav Motlak, MD.
Rivka Ziv Hospital, Tzfad: Alon Marmour, MD, and Michael Flich, MD.
Shaare Zedek Medical Center, Jerusalem: Monty Zion, MD, and Jonathan Balkin, MD.
Sheba Medical Center Heart Institute, Tel Hashomer: Babeth Rabinowitz, MD, and Eddy Barasch, MD.
Soroka Medical Center, Be'er Sheba: Natalio Kristal, MD, and Noa Liel, MD.

Review and advisory board: Gerd Assmann, MD, Peter Bauer, PhD, Shlomo Eisenberg, MD, Lewis H. Kuller, MD, Baruch Modan, MD (chairman), and James Schoenberger, MD.

Steering Committee: members of the scientific committee and directors of participating centers.

Critical events and end-point committee: Chaim Almog, MD, Alexander Battler, MD, and Monty Zion, MD.

Coordinating center: Jacob Agmon, MD, Yisrael Bar-Yehuda, Solomon Behar, MD (medical director), Daniel Brunner, MD, Uri Goldbourt, PhD, Elieser Kaplinsky, MD, Lori Mandelzweig, MPH, and Henrietta Reicher-Reiss, MD.

Central laboratory: Daniel Brunner, MD, Eran Graff, PhD (director), Sara Schwartz, MS, and Joshua Waysbort, MD.

Safety evaluation: Siegfried Heimstra, MD, and Eugene Heyman, PhD.


[^0]:    Manuscript submitted 28 February 1996, and accepted 3 April 1996.

    Correspondence: S. Behar, BIP Coordinating Centre, Neufeld Cardiac Research Institute. Sheba Medical Center. Tel Hashomer 52621, Israel.

